

**MR3720862** 14N05 13F20 14Q10

**Angelini, Elena** [[Angelini, Elena<sup>2</sup>](#)] (I-SIN-IFM);

**Galuppi, Francesco** (I-FERR-MI); **Mella, Massimiliano** (I-FERR-MI);

**Ottaviani, Giorgio** [[Ottaviani, Giorgio Maria](#)] (I-FRNZ-MCS)

**On the number of Waring decompositions for a generic polynomial vector.**

(English summary)

*J. Pure Appl. Algebra* **222** (2018), no. 4, 950–965.

A *power sum decomposition* of a complex homogeneous polynomial  $F \in R = \mathbb{C}[x_0, \dots, x_n]$  of degree  $d$  is a collection of linear forms  $\{\ell_1, \dots, \ell_k\}$  and scalars  $\lambda_1, \dots, \lambda_k \in \mathbb{C}$  such that  $F = \lambda_1 \ell_1^d + \dots + \lambda_k \ell_k^d$ . More generally, suppose we are given several homogeneous forms  $F_1, \dots, F_r \in R$ , with each  $F_i$  homogeneous of degree  $d_i$ . A power sum decomposition of the vector  $F = (F_1, \dots, F_r)$  is a collection of linear forms  $\{\ell_1, \dots, \ell_k\}$  and scalars that express each  $F_i$  as a linear combination of  $d_i$ th powers of the  $\ell_1, \dots, \ell_k$ . Every vector of complex homogeneous polynomials admits a power sum decomposition. The primary interest is in decompositions with  $k$  as small as possible, called *Waring decompositions*.

It is natural to ask under what circumstances a vector  $F$  has a unique Waring decomposition, in which case one says  $F$  is *identifiable*. This has been especially studied in the case that  $F$  is general among vectors with a fixed dimension  $n$ , number of homogeneous forms  $r$ , and degrees  $d_1, \dots, d_r$ , i.e., the forms  $F_1, \dots, F_r$  have general coefficients. Dimension counting gives a necessary condition (the dimension of the space of such vectors  $F$  must be equal to the dimension of the variety of power sum decompositions of the expected length  $k$ ) which can be expressed as a simple arithmetic condition among the numbers  $n$ ,  $r$ , and the  $d_i$ : namely, a necessary condition for identifiability of general vectors  $F$  is that  $\sum_{j=1}^r \binom{d_j+n}{n}$  must be divisible by  $r+n$ . Cases that meet this condition are called *perfect*. The primary question is which perfect cases are *generically identifiable*. In addition, for perfect but generically non-identifiable cases, general vectors  $F$  have finitely many Waring decompositions (but more than one); a second question is the number of Waring decompositions in these cases.

For the case  $r = 1$  (the classical case of Waring rank for a single homogeneous form), recent work of M. Mella [[Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.](#) **358** (2006), no. 12, 5523–5538; [MR2238925](#); [Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.](#) **137** (2009), no. 1, 91–98; [MR2439429](#)] and F. Galuppi and Mella [[“Identifiability of homogeneous polynomials and Cremona transformations”](#), *J. Reine Angew. Math.*, posted November 12, 2017; [MR4036576](#)] determined precisely which perfect cases are generically identifiable. The generically identifiable binary ( $n = 1$ ) cases were determined by C. Ciliberto and F. Russo [[Adv. Math.](#) **200** (2006), no. 1, 1–50; [MR2199628](#)].

For  $r, n > 1$ , the generically identifiable cases are much more rare. Three generically identifiable cases were known classically. One of these classical cases, going back to Weierstrass, is equivalent to the fact that a general pair of quadratic forms has a unique simultaneous diagonalization, which is a close analogue to the well-known statement that a general ellipsoid has uniquely determined axes. (Ignoring distinctions between the complex and real cases, if we assume the quadratic forms are real and positive definite, the linear forms  $\ell_i$  in the Waring decomposition of the pair of quadrics correspond to the axes of the ellipsoid given by the unit ball of one of the quadratic forms, after normalizing so that the unit ball of the other quadratic form is the unit sphere.)

In this paper, the authors find a new generically identifiable case and present evidence that there are no further generically identifiable cases. (It seems that they preferred not to explicitly make a conjecture in the paper. The closest they come is to say, in the abstract, that the new generically identifiable case is “likely the last one”. In the reviewer’s opinion, this deserves to be given serious consideration as a conjecture.)

The new case was *found* by using numerical algebraic geometry to conduct computational exploration. Once found, it was *proved* to be generically identifiable using the method of non-abelian apolarity introduced by J. M. Landsberg and G. M. Ottaviani [Ann. Mat. Pura Appl. (4) **192** (2013), no. 4, 569–606; [MR3081636](#)]. The authors also use non-abelian apolarity to give a uniform proof of generic identifiability for almost all of the previously known cases. Along the way they give a very good introduction and historical overview of the subject.

Some evidence that this may be the last case of generic identifiability is that the authors rule out generic identifiability for some cases. Using numerical algebraic geometry, they rule out generic identifiability for a lot of cases and also gather evidence that in non-identifiable cases the number of decompositions grows rapidly. Also, they prove that for the list of cases with consecutive degrees  $(d_1, d_2) = (a, a + 1)$  and  $n = r = 2$ , with  $a$  even, identifiability holds only for  $a = 2$  (one of the classically known identifiable cases). In addition, for  $a > 2$ , the number of decompositions grows at least quadratically. This proof is not by numerical algebraic geometry, rather by reducing some questions about birational geometry to a consideration of intersections of plane curves. One more interesting result is that when generic identifiability holds, the variety parametrizing power sum decompositions with  $k$  terms (for  $k$  greater than the minimal value) is unirational.

This paper is a very nice introduction to questions around identifiability and gives a valuable historical overview. It poses an interesting question (or maybe conjecture) which seems worthy of attention. And it is a nice showcase of a variety of methods, from birational geometry and geometry of plane curves to computational methods such as numerical algebraic geometry. *Zach Teitler*

---

## References

1. J. Alexander, A. Hirschowitz, The blown-up Horace method: application to fourth-order interpolation, *Invent. Math.* 107 (3) (1992) 585–602. [MR1150603](#)
2. J. Alexander, A. Hirschowitz, Polynomial interpolation in several variables, *J. Algebraic Geom.* 4 (2) (1995) 201–222. [MR1311347](#)
3. A. Anandkumar, R. Ge, D. Hsu, S.M. Kakade, M. Telgarsky, Tensor decompositions for learning latent variable models, *J. Mach. Learn. Res.* 15 (2014) 2773–2832. [MR3270750](#)
4. E. Ballico, A. Bernardi, M.V. Catalisano, L. Chiantini, Grassmann secants, identifiability, and linear systems of tensors, *Linear Algebra Appl.* 438 (2013) 121–135. [MR2993370](#)
5. D.J. Bates, J.D. Hauenstein, A.J. Sommese, C.W. Wampler, Bertini: software for numerical algebraic geometry, available at [bertini.nd.edu](http://bertini.nd.edu).
6. D.J. Bates, J.D. Hauenstein, A.J. Sommese, C.W. Wampler, Numerically Solving Polynomial Systems with Bertini, SIAM, Philadelphia, 2013. [MR3155500](#)
7. J. Cahill, D. Mixon, N. Strawn, Connectivity and irreducibility of algebraic varieties of finite unit norm tight frames, arXiv:1311.4748. [MR3633768](#)
8. E. Carlini, J. Chipalkatti, On Waring’s problem for several algebraic forms, *Comment. Math. Helv.* 78 (3) (2003) 494–517. [MR1998391](#)
9. M. Catalano-Johnson, The possible dimensions of the higher secant varieties, *Am. J. Math.* 118 (2) (1996) 355–361. [MR1385282](#)

10. L. Chiantini, C. Ciliberto, Weakly defective varieties, *Trans. Am. Math. Soc.* 354 (1) (2002) 151–178. [MR1859030](#)
11. C. Ciliberto, F. Russo, Varieties with minimal secant degree and linear systems of maximal dimension on surfaces, *Adv. Math.* 200 (2006) 1–50. [MR2199628](#)
12. P. Comon, Y. Qi, K. Usevich, A polynomial formulation for joint decompositions of symmetric tensors of different order, in: 12th International Conference on Latent Variable Analysis and Signal Separation, Proceedings, LVA/ICA 2015, Liberec, 2015, pp. 22–30.
13. C. Dionisi, C. Fontanari, Grassmann defectivity à la Terracini, *Le Matematiche* 56 (2001) 245–255. [MR2009896](#)
14. F. Galuppi, M. Mella, Identifiability of homogeneous polynomials and Cremona transformations, arXiv:1606.06895 [math.AG]. [MR4036576](#)
15. R. Krone, A. Leykin, Package numerical algebraic geometry for Macaulay 2, available at [www.math.uiuc.edu/Macaulay2](http://www.math.uiuc.edu/Macaulay2).
16. F. London, Ueber die Polarfiguren der ebenen Kurven dritter Ordnung, *Math. Ann.* 36 (1890) 535–584. [MR1510635](#)
17. R. Hartshorne, *Algebraic Geometry*, Grad. Texts Math., vol. 52, Springer, 1977. [MR0463157](#)
18. J.D. Hauenstein, L. Oeding, G. Ottaviani, A.J. Sommese, Homotopy techniques for tensor decomposition and perfect identifiability, arXiv:1501.00090. [MR3987862](#)
19. D. Hilbert, Letter adresseé à M. Hermite, *Gesam. Abh. II*, 148–153.
20. D. Grayson, M. Stillman, Macaulay2, a software system for research in algebraic geometry, available at [www.math.uiuc.edu/Macaulay2](http://www.math.uiuc.edu/Macaulay2).
21. A. Massarenti, M. Mella, Birational aspects of the geometry of varieties of sums of powers, *Adv. Math.* 243 (2013) 187–202. [MR3062744](#)
22. M. Mella, Singularities of linear systems and the Waring problem, *Trans. Am. Math. Soc.* 358 (12) (2006) 5523–5538. [MR2238925](#)
23. M. Mella, Base loci of linear systems and the Waring problem, *Proc. Am. Math. Soc.* 137 (1) (2009) 91–98. [MR2439429](#)
24. S. Mukai, Fano 3-folds, in: *Complex Projective Geometry*, Trieste, 1989/Bergen, 1989, in: *Lond. Math. Soc. Lect. Note Ser.*, vol. 179, Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1992, pp. 255–263. [MR1201387](#)
25. S. Mukai, Polarized K3 surfaces of genus 18 and 20, in: *Complex Projective Geometry*, in: *LMS Lecture Notes Series*, University Press, Cambridge, 1992, pp. 264–276. [MR1201388](#)
26. L. Oeding, G. Ottaviani, Eigenvectors of tensors and algorithms for Waring decomposition, *J. Symb. Comput.* 54 (2013) 9–35. [MR3032635](#)
27. L. Oeding, E. Robeva, B. Sturmfels, Decomposing tensors into frames, *Adv. Appl. Math.* 73 (2016) 125–153. [MR3433503](#)
28. G. Ottaviani, E. Sernesi, On the hypersurface of Lüroth quartics, *Mich. Math. J.* 59 (2010) 365–394. [MR2677627](#)
29. F. Palatini, Sulla rappresentazione delle forme ternarie mediante la somma di potenze di forme lineari, *Rom. Acc. L. Rend.* 12 (1903) 378–384.
30. K. Ranestad, F. Schreyer, Varieties of sums of powers, *J. Reine Angew. Math.* 525 (2000) 147–181. [MR1780430](#)
31. T. Reye, Ueber lineare Systeme und Gewebe von Flächen zweiten grades, *J. Reine Angew. Math.* 82 (1877) 54–83. [MR1579700](#)
32. H.W. Richmond, On canonical forms, *Q. J. Pure Appl. Math.* 33 (1904) 967–984.
33. R.A. Roberts, Note on the plane cubic and a conic, *Proc. Lond. Math. Soc.* (1) 21 (1889) 62–69.
34. G. Scorza, Sopra le figure polari delle curve piane del terzo ordine, *Math. Ann.* 51

- (1899) 154–157.
35. J.J. Sylvester, Collected Works, Cambridge University Press, 1904.
  36. A. Terracini, Sulle  $V_k$  per cui la varietà degli  $S_h(h+1)$ -seganti ha dimensione minore dell'ordinario, Rend. Circ. Mat. Palermo 31 (1911) 392–396.
  37. A. Terracini, Sulla rappresentazione delle coppie di forme ternarie mediante somme di potenze di forme lineari, Ann. Mat. Pura Appl. 24 (1915) 1–10.
  38. K. Weierstrass, Zur theorie der bilinearen and quadratischen Formen, Monatsh. Akad. Wisa. Berlin (1867) 310–338.

*Note: This list reflects references listed in the original paper as accurately as possible with no attempt to correct errors.*